The Northern Powerhouse: Where do Market Towns fit in?

RSA North Briefing

September 2015

Please direct any questions or comments to either:

Kate Dodgson Project Officer
Tel: 07970798247
Email: kate_dodgson@sky.com

Rod Hyde NW Fellowship Chair

Tel: 07973 471 880
Email: Rod.Hyde@council-rsa.org.uk

Pauline Moger NE Fellowship Chair

Pauline.Moger@council-rsa.org.uk
Tel:

Pam Warhust Yorkshire Fellowship Chair

Email: Pam.Warhurst@council-rsa.org.uk
Tel: 07594261990

Summary

The Royal Society for the encouragement of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce (RSA) launched the City Growth Commission (CGC) in 2013. Following the findings of the CGC in 2014, RSA North Fellowship launched a supplemental initiative in August 2015 to investigate the impact on rural areas and how market towns fit into the Northern Powerhouse movement. This paper provides an overview of the Market Towns Initiative (MTI), what it aims to achieve and develop proposals for how rural areas can be part of the Northern Powerhouse movement.

Background and introduction

RSA 2020 Public Services launched the independent City Growth Commission in 2013 to consider how best to enable England's major cities to drive growth and respond to the fiscal and economic challenges of the future.

The RSA North Fellowship's Market Town Initiative (MTI) will be an independent inquiry into how best to enable rural areas and its towns to respond to the devolution of power to the North's major cities under the Northern Powerhouse movement.

The MTI will complement and build on the recent work of the City Growth Commission to develop practical proposals for ensuring that the North's rural towns are able to support and benefit from the city led growth.

RSA North considers rural areas to be instrumental to the success of the Northern Powerhouse movement and hopes to promote a more enlightened and informed debate about the role rural areas can play in driving the UK economy.

Working with Local Enterprise Partnerships, Councils, employers and education facilities, the MTI will consider how rural towns can support growth and economic recovery and practical mechanisms to enable young people to contribute to their local communities and economies whilst also benefitting from the wider Northern Powerhouse movement.

What will the MTI do?

The Market Towns Initiative has set a number of specific questions to address as part of its inquiry. These are:

- What are the key benefits of living in the case study towns (Frodsham, Todmorden, Kendal and Berwick upon Tweed) and what are the key challenges facing residents?

- What will be the likely impact on rural life and livelihoods of more highly paid knowledge intensive jobs in the city regions?

- How will improved connectivity between cities impact on rural areas and what measures need to be taken to minimise any negative aspects?

- How can schools, colleges and adult education facilities be better informed and equipped to enable people living in rural towns to benefit from the Northern Powerhouse?

- How can rural residents be better equipped to find out what choices they could make and what they should be aiming for academically and vocationally in order to enable them to remain part of their rural communities but still take advantage of the Northern Powerhouse economic growth?

- What strategies can rural areas on the edge of City Regions develop to improve the good aspects of rural living and minimise the bad?

The MTI process will allow us to gather information from a wide range of sources:

- *Commissioned research* - the commissioned research will examine the evidence and model and test solutions in relation to the central questions.

- *High level round tables* - these will explore the core questions and test solutions to these in a series of discreet roundtables targeted at key groups of business leaders, council leaders and educational providers. Each round table will include presentations on the core issues and barriers that the MTI is exploring, together with potential solutions to these which will be tested and developed through facilitated discussion.

- *Written contributions* - Fellows and members of the public will be invited via the RSA website and targeted emails to make written contributions.

These inputs will enable the MTI to address these crucial questions and come up with clear proposals that will help promote a fresh debate linking with the devolution agenda.

Format for the Round Table Discussions

Round table discussions will be held in Todmorden, Frodsham, Kendal and Berwick upon Tweed in late 2015. The discussion groups will be by invitation and in some locations it will be possible to accommodate an audience.

The discussions will focus on the questions provided in the appendix of this brief and will be informed by the accompanying initial research. Rod Hyde, NW Fellowship Chair, will chair the meetings.

The discussions will be based upon Chatham House rules, ie any information disclosed during the meeting can be reported by those present but the source of the information cannot be explicitly or implicitly identified. The proceedings will be recorded to facilitate the writing of the final report. Photographs will be taken for publicity material but participants will be given the opportunity to opt out.

When will the MTI report its findings and how will these be taken forward?

Following the launch of the MTI in August 2015, a process of research and engagement will then take place until December 2015. The MTI's final report will then be published in Spring 2016. The MTI will propose specific and practical mechanisms that can make the proposals a reality and will engage with business, local leaders and political parties in order to generate broad support for its proposals.

A project page will be available on the RSA website during the course of the project and will also house the final reports: [url].

APPENDIX: Initial Research and Questions

1. What are the key benefits of living in the case study towns (Frodsham, Todmorden, Kendal and Berwick upon Tweed) and what are the key challenges facing residents?

i. Homes in a market town are typically 12% more expensive than the average property in the county according to Lloyds Bank research 2014.

ii. Rural areas have roughly average house prices but lower salaries so houses are less affordable. Urban areas have greater variation in property and higher salaries so more properties are more affordable:

Town	Average house price	Average weekly earnings	Affordability of housing	Self containment (live and work in town)
National	£185,619	£518	6.89 times	
Berwick upon Tweed	£171,546	£395	8.35 times earnings	81%
Todmorden	£130,694	£489	5.14 times earnings	59%
Frodsham	£249,739	£462	10.39 times earnings	26%
Kendal	£167,012	£479	6.93 times earnings	72%

iii.

iii. In April 2010 there were 321 second homes registered in Kendal (2.3% of domestic properties) - lower than district level of 6.8%

iv. 81% of residents work within Berwick upon Tweed whereas just 26% of Frodsham residents work within the town.

v. Rural households spend an estimated £500 per week compared to £450 by urban households. Transport costs account for the biggest difference as they are more expensive in rural areas but communications, clothing and housing (net inc fuel and power) are generally higher in urban areas. Rural residents are more reliant on private transport (predominantly cars) due to the lack of public transport.

vi. The Index of Multiple Deprivation shows that people in rural areas generally live longer than those in urban areas but in the least deprived areas urban life expectancies are slightly better than in rural areas.

vii. The rural population is predominantly aged between 45 and 64 and is therefore generally older than the urban population.

viii. Over 80% of the UK population (42,388,060) lived in Urban areas in 2010[1], yet less than 33% of the UK's land area is classified as urban. The 80% is predicted to rise to 92.2% by 2030.

ix. Density and property types:

	England	Berwick	Todmorden	Frodsham	Kendal
Detached homes	22%	16%	12%	38%	20%
Semi-detached	31%	40%	17%	34%	35%
Terrace	24%	26%	58%	16%	28%
Flat	21%	18%	13%	10%	17%
Caravan/mobile	0.4%	0.3%	0.1%	2%	0.2%
Density - number of people per hectare	4.07	7.3	2.9	4.3	26.36
% of residents aged under 16	17.5%	19%	20%	18%	19%
% of residents aged over 65	16.4%	20%	15%	24%	20%
% of homes occupied by single person under 65	18%	16%	23%	15%	18%
% of homes occupied by single person over 65	12%	15%	12%	16%	15%
lone parent households	10.6%	10%	11%	9%	8%
Average occupancy per household	2.4	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.2

x.

xi. Access to 8 key services such as employment, primary schools, secondary schools, further education, GP, hospital, food store, town centre are accessed within a reasonable time by 60% of urban residents compared with 48% of rural residents.

xii. The Department of Education identifies low deprivation as the most important element to a good start in the education system hence better results in rural areas which are generally less deprived. More pupils in rural areas left school with at least 5 A*-C GCSEs and entered higher education institutions than pupils living in urban areas.

[1] Defra Statistical Digest of Rural England 2012 https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/69493/pb13642-rural-digest-2012.pdf

ONS also identified an association with sparsity, as the proportion of pupils living in less sparse areas achieving 5 or more GCSEs was greater than pupils in sparse areas.

2. What will be the likely impact on rural life and livelihoods of more highly paid knowledge intensive jobs in the city regions?

i. The Northern Powerhouse is made up of the core city regions of Liverpool City Region Combined Authority, Greater Manchester Combined Authority, West Yorkshire Combined Authority, Sheffield Combined Authority, Humber Local Enterprise Partnership and the North East Combined Authority and contains 4.5million jobs (accounting for 16% of all Britain's jobs). These jobs are not evenly spread across the region: 27% of all jobs within the Northern Powerhouse are within the Manchester City Region and 22% are in the West Yorkshire Combined Authority.

ii. The Northern Powerhouse area is home to 16.7% of the UK population (10.2 million). Of the 10.2million 25% live in Manchester City region and 21% in the West Yorkshire Combined Authority.

iii. Data shows that over a 10 year period many people move from rural areas to urban areas and then return to rural areas, but anecdotal evidence shows that in London people are increasingly staying there to have families.

iv. Studies by Newcastle University show residents living in one area and working elsewhere earn more than those living and working in the same area. However, whilst commuters bring in money to their place of residence which has been earned outside that locality, Newcastle University identified that commuting also represents a leakage of money from the locality for other activities including retail and leisure spending, which in turn impacts on the rural high street. The Newcastle studies also show that in-migrants tend to be more likely to commute and to spend less money locally than local residents.

v. In rural areas nearly 20% of residents work from home compared to just over 10% in urban areas and nearly 20% or rural residents are self employed compared to 12% urban residents. Within rural areas sparsely populated areas have far more home based workers (26% compared to 13% of less sparsely which is comparable with urban areas).

vi. Rural incomes are at least partially dependent on the ability to commute, particularly for male full time workers (NCL).

vii. 11,260,336 working residents in the UK commuted from one local authority to another for work on the 2011 Census day.

viii. Commuter patterns for case study towns:

Town	% regular commuters	Number of commuters from one LA to another	Time to drive to nearest core city	Time on train to nearest core city	Cost of train to nearest core city
National		11,260,336			
Berwick upon Tweed	11%	1097	1hr30mins to Newcastle and 1 hr 13mins to Edinburgh	48 mins to Newcastle and 43 mins to Edinburgh	£36.20 to Newcastle and £35 to Edinburgh
Todmorden	33%	2959	41 mins to Leeds, 42 mins to Manchester	1 hour to Leeds 26 mins to Manchester	£10.90 to Leeds, £11.20 to Manchester.

Town	% regular commuters	Number of commuters from one LA to another	Time to drive to nearest core city	Time on train to nearest core city	Cost of train to nearest core city
Frodsham	74%	5579	42 mins to Manchester and 30 mins to Liverpool	51 mins to Manchester and 1 hr 15 mins to Liverpool	£11.80 to Manchester and £8.70 to Liverpool
Kendal	18%	3971	Leeds 1:34 Manchester 1:16 Liverpool 1:21 Carlisle 51mins Newcastle 1:46	Leeds 2:39 Manchester 1:37 Liverpool 1:56 Carlisle 57mins Newcastle 2:47	Leeds £44.30 Manchester £19.10 Liverpool £21.60 Carlisle £16.20 Newcastle £46.50

ix. The majority of private sector businesses are not registered for VAT or PAYE. In 2014 there were 2.3 million businesses registered for VAT or PAYE accounting for 43% of the total population with 76% of businesses being non-employers. There was an estimated 3 million unregistered businesses in England at the start of 2014 according to Government figures. London and the South East have the highest business density rates with the North East having the lowest business density rate with 701 businesses per 10,000 adults. On this basis Berwick upon Tweed probably has around 800 businesses. Frodsham's business database shows around 1200 with over 400 being home based sole traders. Additional data is required for Todmorden and Kendal.

x. According to the 2011 Census data Kendal had above average employment levels, whilst Todmorden had above average self employment levels. In addition, 30% of households in Todmorden did not have a car:

	England	Berwick	Todmorden	Frodsham	Kendal
No cars of vans in household	26%	29%	30%	16%	20%
Employed	52%	54%	51%	54%	59%
Self employed	9.8%	9%	11%	9%	10%
Unemployed	4.3%	4%	4.7%	3%	2%
Long term sick	4%	3%	6%	3%	3%
Retired	13.7%	19%	15%	21%	17%
number of 16 - 24 unemployed*		124	53	121	126

* these figures are based on young people not in employment at the 2011 Census but evidence from Frodsham shows that there are additional NEETs (not in employment, education or training) that are not captured by the data sets as they are being supported by their families and not claiming benefits. Frodsham's data also shows that young people aged 19-24 are twice as likely to be NEET as those aged 16 - 19.

xi. Self employment is on the rise from around 10% at the 2011 Census to 15% of all employment in June 2014 according to Government statistics.

xii. Government Business Population Estimates reveals that in 2014, as in previous years, growth was mainly driven by non-employing businesses, which increased by 263,000 (up 7.1%) since the start of 2013. Businesses with no employees accounted for 76% of all private sector businesses in 2014 (4 million businesses).

xiii. 42.9% of all corporate businesses are single employee limited companies and sole proprietors represented 19.6% of total enterprises in June 2014 (latest figures). Partnerships represented 10.3%.

xiv. At the start of 2014, 99.3% of the 5.2 million private sector businesses were small (0-49 employees) and 99.9% were small or medium sized (SME's). 5.2million SMEs accounted for 60% (15.2million) of UK private sector employment.

xv. 18% of SMEs are in the Construction sector, 15% in the Professional and Scientific sector, 10% Wholesale, Retail Trade and Repair and 1% was in Mining, Quarrying and Utilities.

xvi. At the start of 2014 SMEs accounted for 60% of UK private sector employment with a combined turnover of £1.2trillion (33% of private sector turnover) but 40% had been refused loans.

i. Support for SMEs varies according to location. SMEs based in one of 50 designated cities can receive broadband connection voucher grants worth up to £3,000 aimed at driving productivity, innovation and growth. Similarly, businesses based in Wales can apply for up to £1,000 from the Welsh Government to improve insufficient broadband access. Newport City Council is the only authority to be supporting broadband connection with grants of up to £3,000 being paid directly to the supplier.

xvii. BPE estimated number of businesses and turnover at the start of 2014:

	Businesses	**Employment (thousands)**	**Turnover £ millions**
All businesses	5,243,135	25,229	3,521,254
SMEs (2 - 249 employees)	5,236,390	15,159	1,647,201
Small (0-49 employees)	5,204,915	12,084	1,170,337
All employers	1,277,360	20,876	3,290,110
With no employees	3,965,775	4,353	231,143
1-9	1,044,385	3,923	424,299
10-49	194,755	3,807	514,895
50-249	31,475	3,077	476,864
250 or more	6,745	10,070	1,874,053

3. How can schools, colleges and adult education facilities be better informed and equipped to enable people living in rural towns to benefit from the Northern Powerhouse?

i. The level and range of skills in the workforce are consistently a barrier to potential growth. High value employment tends to require advanced skills and advanced skills in turn tend to attract high wages.

ii. 20% of all jobs in the Northern Powerhouse can be classed as knowledge intensive business services (KIBS) in comparison to London, where knowledge intensive businesses represent over 30% of the total business base. 48% of the total employment in the Netherlands is knowledge intensive.

iii. Skills valued by many knowledge intensive service sector firms include numeracy, analytical capacity, IT proficiency, creativity and entrepreneurialism.

iv. The Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development (CIPD) recommend a large scale review of the education system in its report *Over-qualification and Skills Mismatch in the Graduate Labour Market 2015*. Drawing on data from the European Social Survey, it claims that 58.8% of UK graduates are in non-graduate jobs, although its own *Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education survey* found that 68% of graduates who left UK universities in 2014 were in graduate level jobs within 6 months of leaving.

v. More than 27% of working adults in the UK have a degree or higher according to the 2011 Census. Although the ONS shows a major long term shift towards a higher proportion of graduates in the working age population, the increase is uneven with 60% of the working population of the 14 inner London boroughs having a degree or higher.

vi. The EU innovation scoreboard sets out a range of inputs and outputs eg innovation drivers (input measures): science and engineering graduates per 1000 population; population with tertiary education; broadband penetration; participation in life long learning; youth education attainment level. On this innovation scoreboard the UK scores lowest on knowledge creation: R&D expenditure as % of GDP; share of high medium tech R&D as % of manufacturing R&D; share of enterprises receiving public funding for innovation; share of university R&D financed by business sector.

vii. Whilst the UK has world class universities across the country, the Department for Business Innovation & Skills most recent *Skills for Life Survey 2011* revealed that 49% of adults have the maths skills level expected at primary school. The survey did however identify a large increase in literacy skills with 57% of respondents achieving a level 2 score or above compared to just 44% in 2003.

viii. According to the Higher Education Statistics Agency, 92.1% of university leavers were in employment or further study 6 months after graduating in 2012 - 2013, up from 90% in the previous year. Just 25 institutions have rates above 95%, The University of Lancaster and University of Chester being two of them, with the University of Manchester ranking 25 in the Global Employability University Ranking 2014.

ix. Cities such as Boston (identified by the CGC as a case study) have reversed their economic decline in part by building on the quality of their higher education institutions[2] and using their universities as dynamos for economic growth. A 2004 study by MIT and the Bank of Boston found that MIT graduates and faculty had created 4,000 companies, employing 1.1 million people and generating 232bn dollars in worldwide sales.

x. Kendal is 30 miles from the University of Lancaster ranked 9 in the University League Table. Frodsham has 8 universities within 30 miles. Todmorden has 5 universities within 40 miles. Berwick upon Tweed has no English top ranking universities within 60 miles (Edinburgh University is 56 miles away).

xi. Qualification levels in case study towns (source ONS 2011 - latest census):

	England	Berwick	Todmorden	Frodsham	Kendal
Number of residents aged 16+		9973	9912	7540	22064
% of residents without qualifications	22%	29%	23%	19%	21%
Level 1	8%	10%	9%	11%	10%
Level 2	15%	17%	18%	14%	18%
Level 3	11%	10%	13%	11%	14%
Level 4	4%	3%	5%	7%	5%
Degree +	18%	9%	18%	24%	18%
Apprenticeships	6%	8%	7%	7%	7%

x. Accessibility of education provision

Town	Population	Number of residents aged 16 and over	Number of primary schools	Number of secondary schools	Distance to further education provision	Distance to higher education provision
England		42,989,620				
Berwick upon Tweed	12,043	9973	12	4 (2 being middle schools)	3 college campus within town	56 miles to Edinburgh Uni. 62 miles to Newcastle Uni, 64 miles to Northumbria Uni.

[2] Metro Growth: The UK's Economic Opportunity. February 2014. City Growth Commission http://www.citygrowthcommission.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/Metro-Growth-February-2014.pdf

Town	Population	Number of residents aged 16 and over	Number of primary schools	Number of secondary schools	Distance to further education provision	Distance to higher education provision
Todmorden	12,117	8969	7	1	10 miles to Hopwood Hall College, 12 miles to Calderdale College, 20 miles to Bradford college. Very limited number of courses provided through Todmorden Community College	40 miles to Leeds Uni 32 miles to Manchester Uni 19 miles to Bradford University. All around an hours travel time
Frodsham	9077	7540	4	1	10 miles to Mid Cheshire College, 12 miles to Warrington Collegiate, 12 miles to West Cheshire College	17 miles to University of Chester. 18 miles to Liverpool Uni. 28 miles to Manchester Uni,
Kendal	30,171	22,064	17	2	Kendal College within town.	30 miles to the University of Lancaster, 46 miles to University of Cumbria. 76 miles to University of Manchester, 43 miles to University of Central Lancashire

xi.

xi. University ranking

University	CUG Rank 2015
Durham	5
Lancaster	9
York	17
Leeds	19
Newcastle	26
Manchester	28
Liverpool	39
Northumbria	60
Bradford	63
Liverpool John Moores	68
Manchester Metropolitan	73
Central Lancashire	91

University	CUG Rank 2015
Chester	93
Cumbria	111

xii.

xii. School spend per pupil, absence and education destination:

Town	Number of pupils	Spend per pupil £	Pupil absence in 2014	% disadvantaged pupils	% of pupils attaining 5 GCSEs grade A* to C	Education destination FE inc 6th form	Education destination Apprenticeship
National median		5856	5.2%	28.5%		83%	4%
Berwick Academy	752	5442	5.2%	22%	43%	83%	3%
Todmorden High School	683	5222	6.4%	29.9%	51%	78%	8%
Helsby HIgh School	1335	4269	4.9%	13.1%	71%	91%	3%
The Queen Katherine School, Kendal	1393	4636	5.6%	15.1%	61%	87%	5%
Kirkbie Kendal School	914	4614	4.3%	13.6%	61%	90%	6%

xii. Ofsted's *Report on Education, Children's Services and Skills 2013/14* states that primary schools in England are getting better but improvement in secondary schools has stalled with 82% of primary schools classed as good or outstanding but just 71% of secondary schools classed as at least good resulting in 170,000 pupils now being in 'inadequate' secondary schools compared with 100,000 in 2011/12. The Report also highlights that although children from poor backgrounds are doing better, particularly at primary, they are still too far behind other pupils.

xiii. 18% of children in England's schools are recorded as having special educational needs. Many of these children come from disadvantaged backgrounds, with pupils who are eligible for free schools meals being twice as likely as others to have special educational needs.

xiv. The Department for Education states in its *Policy Paper: education of disadvantaged children that in 2013* 37.9% of pupils who qualified for free school meals got 5 GCSEs, including English and Maths at A* to C, compared with 64.6% of pupils who do not qualify.

xv. The number of apprenticeships fell during the industrial decline of the 1980's (down from 25% of all school leavers in the mid 1960's). In 2013/14 more than 891,000 people were undertaking an apprenticeship in England with 90% of apprentices staying in employment on completion and 71% staying the same employer. However, the Local Government Association identified 42% of all apprenticeships created in the last 5 years went to people over 25, with 70% of apprentices previously working for the employer.

xvi. The perceived quality of apprenticeships varies, with more than half of engineering apprenticeships being offered at level 3 compared to just 22% in customer service and 13% in hospitality and catering. While an engineering apprentice benefits from an average of 10 hours a week in off the job learning, for a retail or customer service apprentice the average in 2008 was just one hour per week.

xvii. In most other countries apprenticeships are level 3 qualifications or higher. In England apprenticeships at level 2 far outnumber 'advanced' apprenticeships at Level 3.

xviii. An ICM Research survey of over 500 English firms rated apprenticeships as the most successful qualification to move young people into employment. Employers including British Airways, Price Waterhouse Cooper and Unilever rated higher apprenticeships the highest for employability, with employers finding apprentices 15% more employable than young people with other qualifications.

xix. Fewer than one in 10 employers in England offer apprenticeships compared to at least a quarter of employers in Australia, Germany and Switzerland. In Germany, almost all firms with over 500 employees take on apprentices, while in England under a third of very large firms do according to Government research in 2013 although according to www.gov.uk 44% of UK businesses plan on taking on apprentices within the next 5 years.

xx. Apprenticeship comparisons:

Country	Number of apprentices for every 1,000 employees
England	11 apprentices for every 1,000 employees
Australia	39 apprentices for every 1,000 employees
Germany	40 apprentices for every 1,000 employees
Switzerland	43 apprentices for every 1,000 employees

xxi.

xxi. Apprenticeship sectors UK 2009/10

Sector	Count	Level 3+ %	Female %
Customer service	29,410	22	64
Business Administration	27,020	31	77
Hospitality and catering	21,470	13	49
Children's care learning and development	20,110	44	96

Sector	Count	Level 3+ %	Female %
Health and social care	17,880	32	85
Retail	16,910	11	55
Hairdressing	16,240	25	91
Engineering	15,000	52	3
Construction	14,070	22	2
Active Leisure and learning	11,340	22	27

xxii.

4. How can rural residents be better equipped to find out what choices they could make and what they should be aiming for academically and vocationally in order to enable them to remain part of their rural communities but still take advantage of the Northern Powerhouse economic growth?

i. Berwick upon Tweed, Todmorden and Kendal all have Job Centres located within the town, as well as adult education facilities. Frodsham has neither although Frodsham library does offer basic IT skills and a work club.

ii. All schools within the UK must secure independent careers guidance for all year 8 - 13 pupils[3] . The statutory guidance to schools stresses that inspiring every pupil through more real-life contacts with the world of work can help them understand where different choices can take them in the future and recommends:

   1. proving employer talks, career fairs, college and university visits, motivational speakers, coaches and mentors
   2. build strong links with employers who can help boost pupils attitudes and employability skills and inform pupils about the range of roles and opportunities
   3. offer high quality work experience
   4. widen access to advice on options post 16 eg apprenticeships, entrepreneurialism or other vocational routes
   5. face to face advice and guidance
   6. work with local authorities to identify potential NEETs
   7. provide pupils with information on financial support that can help them stay in education post 16
   8. work with Jobcentre Plus to develop a smooth pathway between education and work

iii. Careers guidance in schools has long been criticised as being inadequate and patchy. Ofsted reported in 2013 that 'only one in five schools were effective in ensuring that all students were receiving the level of information they needed.'

iv. In 2010 the Coalition government abolished Regional Development Agencies and established 39 business led Local Economic Partnerships (LEPs). The Cheshire and Warrington LEP is focused on the development of the Science Corridor in conjunction with the University of Chester, Sci-Tech at Daresbury, Thornton Science Park and Jodrell Bank but links with the local high school are lacking.

v. In university-industry collaboration the World Economic Forum ranked the UK fourth (behind Finland, US and Switzerland).

---

[3] https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/440795/Careers_Guidance_Schools_Guidance.pdf

5. How will improved connectivity between cities impact on rural areas and what measures need to be taken to minimise any negative aspects?

i. Table of present connectivity:

Town	Self containment (live and work in town)	Average weekly wage	% of pupils attaining 5 GCSEs grade A* to C	Number of commuters from one LA to another	Time to drive to nearest core city	Time on train to nearest core city	Cost of train to nearest core city
National				11,260,336			
Berwick upon Tweed	81%	£395	43%	19%	1hr30mins to Newcastle and 1 hr 13mins to Edinburgh	48 mins to Newcastle and 43 mins to Edinburgh	£36.20 to Newcastle and £35 to Edinburgh
Todmorden	59%	£489	51%	33% commute out of Todmorden with 25% commuting to Manchester	41 mins to Leeds, 42 mins to Manchester	1 hour to Leeds 26 mins to Manchester	£10.90 to Leeds, £11.20 to Manchester.
Frodsham	26%	£462	71%	74% commute out of Frodsham.	42 mins to Manchester and 30 mins to Liverpool	51 mins to Manchester and 1 hr 15 mins to Liverpool	£11.80 to Manchester and £8.70 to Liverpool
Kendal	72%	£479	61%	18%	51 mins to Carlisle 1 hr 15 mins to Manchester 1 hr 21 mins to Liverpool	1 hour to Carlisle 1 hr 30 mins to Manchester 2hrs 15 mins to Liverpool	£13.50 to Carlisle £19 to Manchester £21.50 to Liverpool

ii.

ii. Of the 26.5million people aged 16-74 in England and Wales, 10.4% work from home and 81.2% regularly commute. The average distance commuted to work increased from 8.3miles in 2001 to 9.3 miles in 2011.

iii. 33% of Todmorden workers commute out of Todmorden, with 25% (1121) working in Manchester. It takes 41 mins to travel to Leeds by car (1 hour on the train costing £10.90), or 42 mins to Manchester (26 mins by train costing £11.20) with 4 trains per hour on average to Manchester and 3 or 4 trains per hour to Leeds.

iv. 81% live and work in Berwick upon Tweed with only 19% commuting outside the area. The main commuter destinations are Scotland 42%, Alnwick 18% Newcastle upon Tyne 8%. 1,487 workers commute into Berwick upon Tweed, 66% are from Scotland and 21% from Alnwick. There is little use of public transport. 34% travel to work by car, only 1% by train. A significant number 15% commute to work on foot. 20% are home based. 33% of households do not have a car or van. It takes 48 minutes to travel from Berwick upon Tweed to Newcastle on the train costing £36.20 (1 hr 30 mins by car), 43 minutes to Edinburgh on the train costing £35.00 (1 hr 13 mins by car).

v. In Frodsham there is little use of public transport with just one train per hour to Manchester, resulting in 47% commuting by car compared to 2% by train. 6% commute to work on foot. 13% are home based. 16% of households do not have a car or van. The Halton Curve is due to re-open in 2017 linking Frodsham with Liverpool. Whilst this will improve connectivity to Liverpool local businesses and residents are concerned that workers from surrounding areas will take up valuable free parking at the station, increasing congestion and preventing shoppers from parking to use the local facilities which will ultimately weaken the local economy.

vi. Trains to Carlisle and Manchester from Kendal run hourly although 20.8% of households in Kendal do not own a car or van compared to 15.3% at district level.

vii. Commuters are less engaged with rural community life and spend less time volunteering within the community and less money locally on retail and leisure (NCL).

6. What strategies can rural areas on the edge of City Regions develop to improve the good aspects of rural living and minimise the bad?

i. Berwick upon Tweed has the highest rate of self containment but the lowest qualifications and the lowest weekly earnings.

ii. Cheshire and Warrington LEP is focused on the development of the Science Corridor in conjunction with the University of Chester, Sci-Tech at Daresbury, Thornton Science Park and Jodrell Bank. Sci-Tech Daresbury anticipates that with private sector investment of £150m to expand its facilities there is the potential to deliver more than 10,000 jobs over the next 20 years. This is dependent upon infrastructure, Government investment in major science projects at Daresbury and new investment from major research and science businesses and institutions. Frodsham is just 6 miles from Sci-Tech.

iii. The North East Local Enterprise Partnership is responsible for driving the delivery of the Economic Plan but Berwick upon Tweed does not feature in the Plan. In December 2014 a £250million investment in the A1 from Morpeth to Ellingham was announced but the 25 mile stretch to the Scottish border through Berwick is not included.

iv. Creative Hubs in our market towns should be part of the Northern Powerhouse plan. This was the major conclusion of the first of four round table discussions in Todmorden on 17 September 2015. The group also focused on the benefit of improving public spaces in the town and generally how to retain its community spirit and enhance the character of the town which is small enough to embrace but large enough to create opportunities to prosper. This is a strong reason why people, who can shop online for most things, chose to visit, spend and even move to rural towns.

v. A creative hub is managed workspace fronted by a coffee shop. A market town hub could act as a spoke in a hub and spoke model with the main hubs being city centres like Manchester and Leeds. Our research has shown that the average value of housing stock in Todmorden is low in comparison to other market towns and this is attracting young creatives into the town. Todmorden also has good rail links with Manchester (4 trains per hour) and Leeds (3 trains per hour). With the right atmosphere, a creative hub attracts creatives and other knowledge workers and the town would benefit in a number of ways:

A hub brings people together who would not normally have met. Many businesses have been launched and grown as a result of chance meetings in innovation, incubator and creative hubs. With a town hub, these businesses would be Todmorden based.

It would provide the opportunity for young people in the town to engage in meaningful work experience in knowledge-based businesses.

People can split their time between city and town leading to reduced commuting with the benefit of more time in town supporting local retail and engaging in the community.

A creative hub would become the natural focus for business advice and support for all SMEs. Some of this would be mutual as common interest would spur activity. In addition the local council could provide whatever support it thought appropriate in a very cost effective manner.

vi. Like many rural towns, Todmorden does not have a town square or attractive areas around its waterways. There was a strong feeling at the roundtable discussion that this is an opportunity lost. Just as serendipity works in a creative hub, public spaces bring people together and enhance community spirit. On the economic front, public spaces mean that people linger and will spend more in the town. Car parking is an issue and the wrong solution can block a town with commuter cars and detract visitors and residents who will support local businesses.

vii. There is a strong community spirit in Todmorden and it was felt that the town had been lucky that circumstances had conspired to maintain this spirit during the downturn in the fortunes of the town. The group was able to point to other towns in the area that had not faired as well and the town should not leave the future quality of life in the town to chance. With the good rail links to the city region and the lure of well-paid jobs, there is a danger that the town could become a dormitory town. A creative hub and improvement in public physical spaces would be good counters to this trend. Filling the town’s spaces with commuter cars would not.

viii. County Councils are responsible for services across the whole county including education, transport, planning, fire and public safety, social care, libraries, waste management, Council Tax collections, housing and trading standards.

ix. Parish, community and town councils have limited powers but can help on a number of local issues including allotments, public clocks, bus shelters, community centres, play areas and play equipment, grants to help local organisations, consultation on neighbourhood planning. They also have the power to issue fixed penalty fines for litter, graffiti, fly posting and dog offences.

x. Metros need to improve their capacity to collect and analyse data about the economy and public spending. Without robust granular data metros are limited in their ability to plan and commission effectively. The main source of residential data at town level is the 2011 Census and subsequent Labour Force Surveys but Local Authorities do not have accurate data on business activities, income streams and cost of public services.